

**Documents to U (MNU/MNUG)**  
**University of Minnesota – Interlibrary Loan Lending**  
*OCLC MNU \* RLG MNUG \* NUC MnU*



**15 Andersen Library, 222 21<sup>st</sup> Ave. S., University of Minnesota**  
**Minneapolis, MN 55455-0439 USA**  
**Phone: 612-624-4388, Fax: 612-624-4522, Ariel: 160.94.20.178, e-mail: [docstou@tc.umn.edu](mailto:docstou@tc.umn.edu)**

*This article is delivered directly from the humanities, social & educational sciences, general sciences, mathematics, journalism and engineering collections of the University of Minnesota.*  
*Thank you for using our service.*

*If you have problems with delivery, please contact us within 48 hours.*

**Notice: This material may be protected by copyright law. (Title 17 U.S. Code)**

University of Minnesota Interlibrary Loan

Trans. #:807525  LL : 98489288  <sup>sd</sup> 12/31/12

Article Location : TC Wilson Library P40.5.G76 L36 2010  
Borrower : AZU Date : 12/28/2012 5:15:57 PM

UUM,UUM,COF,KKU,\*MNU

AUTHOR : Mendoza-Denton and Osborne  
TITLE : Language and identities /  
IMPRINT : Edinburgh ; Edinburgh University Press,

Article : ~~Two Languages, Two Identities?~~  
Volume : Issue : Month : Year : 2009 Pages : ~~118-129~~

ODYSSEY  
ISxN: 9780748635771 (pbk.) System ID : OCLC 320798579 Copyright Compliance : CCG  
Patron : Mendoza-Denton, Norma C  
NOTES : SHARES MaxCost: 50.00IFM

Loaned To:  
AZU - INTERLIBRARY LOAN  
UNIVERSITY ARIZONA LIBRARIES  
1510 E UNIVERSITY  
TUCSON US-AZ US 85721-0055

Loaned From : Documents to U : 15 Andersen Library, Univ. of MN 222 - 21<sup>st</sup> Ave S. Minneapolis, MN 55455

MNU DTU ODYSSEY

SD

## Two Languages, Two Identities?

Norma Mendoza-Denton and Dana Osborne

---

### I. Introduction

Despite the fact that bi-/multilingualism is the most common linguistic condition of societies, and although no state is exclusively monolingual (Thomason and Kaufman 1988), academic and popular accounts of bi-/multilingualism have struggled with monolingualist biases. From the earliest (modern) academic descriptions of bilingual individuals, we find narratives such as the following:

White Thunder, a man around 40, speaks less English than Menomini, and that is a strong indictment, for his Menomini is atrocious. His vocabulary is small, his inflections are often barbarous, he constructs sentences of a few threadbare models. He may be said to speak no language tolerably (Bloomfield 1927: 395).

The charge and spectre of speaking ‘no language’ similarly follows us into the present, with horrified accounts from journalists who occasionally write exposés on ‘alingual’ migrant children in American classrooms. The following is from a *Washington Post* article on immigrant four-year-olds in a Head Start class in Montgomery County, one of the United States’ richest jurisdictions: ‘When a . . . boy flung dirt on others with his shovel, or when some wanted to put worms in a bucket, the children had no words in any language. They filled the air with inarticulate grunts and cries of “Heeeey” (Schulte 2002). The same story, this time entitled ‘Alingual education: young victims of mass immigration’, was picked up shortly afterwards in the *National Review* (Krikorian 2002). The US does not have a monopoly on bilingualism panics, nor is population movement the only cause of such panics. In 2008, a family court in Wales heard an English expert witness testify that Welsh-medium classes would cause retardation in some children and could not stimulate a child to the same level as English medium education (Shipton 2008). This testimony remained unchallenged and caused a shift in custody arrangements for the child at the centre of the trial. Widespread social reaction followed, including from Wales’ First Minister, who instructed the Ministry of Justice to conduct an investigation.

Against this prickly political background, research on bilingualism seems a Sisyphean task. Research retreads paths already worn, continually 'proving' that bilingualism and linguistic diversity in general are not deficits (Labov 1982; Romaine 1995; Zentella 1997; Smitherman and Baugh 2002), that bilingualism in itself will not tear politics asunder, but bureaucracy is much more likely to do so (Fishman 1991), and demonstrating that bi- and multilinguals have cognitive flexibility and facilitation of various tasks because of using two or more languages (Gardner-Chloros 1991; Sommer 2004; Kroll and de Groot 2005).

The present chapter reviews the literature on bilingualism and identity, taking a necessarily restricted scope dealing primarily with sociolinguistic and linguistic anthropological approaches. We restrict the concentration of our coverage to bilingualism literature from the last thirty years, and we cannot for reasons of space include detailed discussion of psycholinguistic approaches, structural approaches to codeswitching, bilingual education, language policy, endangered languages, or language revitalisation, despite their importance (see instead Romaine 1995; Mendoza-Denton 1999; Muysken 2000; Li Wei 2007). We acknowledge the postcolonial condition by focusing on power relations, and attempt to fill some gaps by treating lesser-known linguistic situations and integrating linguistic anthropology. We primarily attend to semiotic and performative approaches to bilingualism and identity, and the overarching question we seek to answer may be framed as: how far can and do speakers strategically mobilise one language or another to achieve desired social and political effects?

## 2. Linking bilingualism and political economy

Discussion, analysis and policy designed to address issues of bilingualism are intimately connected to political economy. Heller points out that the 'common sense' understanding of bilingualism is implicitly predicated on the 'coexistence of two linguistic systems' (Heller 2007: 1), but the story becomes complicated when considering the political environment contributing to what is seen as bilingualism. For Heller, the assumption that distinct linguistic systems exist allows for the reification of languages, rather than allowing us to see that language policy and classification are media through which social and political ends crystallise. The very project of defining 'bilingual' as a category ultimately serves to normalise the monoglot standard, and historically this has helped bolster the status of nation-states as bounded and fully controlled entities (Heller 2007: 4–5; Woolard 1999; see also Bucholtz and Hall 2004a on the fallacy of bounded identity). Examining the processes that contribute to the constitution of contemporary nation-states concerned with issues of bilingualism against the practices of the individual actors who enact bilingualism helps us understand how the nation's ideological concerns are reflected and reified in the everyday practices of speakers (and policymakers). This perspective, informed by Bourdieu [1972](1978), contributes to a theorisation of the bilingual that is shaped in a complex way by macro-sociological and micro-interactionist factors.

Moyer and Rojo (2007) point out that in many contexts state-run institutions such as schools magnify the implications and consequences of bilingualism because of their homogenising role (see also Coronado Suzán 1999 for literature on indigenous Mexico). In the case of Madrid, Spain, policies and procedures designed to grapple with language heterogeneity reinforce societal norms privileging the dominance of Castilian Spanish.

This is accomplished through erasure of capital and resources; in a sense, they them an asset, [other] languages (Arab). This is demonstrated by the fact that essentially to ensuring the teaching of them. In addition to implicit policies, ideological usefulness, classifying some languages not fully able to participate in civic act case of Spain, full citizenship is achieved 'students who own a valued resource (instruction) because of their social and who are legitimate in the social space or has ideological implications but also in ment and the economy affect more than provide access to resources. As Bourdieu

The linguistic relation of power the linguistic competences present on their symbolic capital, i.e. they receive from a group. (Bourdieu)

The material consequences of bilingual festivities, as in the case described by F new globalised economic conditions that as the world becomes increasingly international. In examining the case of Canadian language articulates the role of language production framework of the globalised economy 'with intellectual and communicative labour,' (2005: 5). According to da Silva et al.:

contrary to what one might expect from its 'founding people' (the not just bilingualism that is very not institutionalized because (cially' multilingual – a linguistic discrediting its nationalist roots.

## 3. Social contexts of language choice

There have been two basic approaches to choice and codeswitching (the alternation speech/sign stream). Auer and Di Luzio the 'brought-along meaning' and the 'by these distinctions to organise some class problem.

ch on bilingualism seems a Sisyphean usually 'proving' that bilingualism and v 1982; Romaine 1995; Zentella 1997; 1 itself will not tear polities asunder, hman 1991), and demonstrating that facilitation of various tasks because of '1; Sommer 2004; Kroll and de Groot

ngualism and identity, taking a neces- linguistic and linguistic anthropologi- ar coverage to bilingualism literature s of space include detailed discussion hes to codeswitching, bilingual edu- language revitalisation, despite their Denton 1999; Muysken 2000; Li Wei by focusing on power relations, and . linguistic situations and integrating iotic and performative approaches to tion we seek to answer may be framed se one language or another to achieve

ly

: issues of bilingualism are intimately hat the 'common sense' understand- coexistence of two linguistic systems' l when considering the political envi- .. For Heller, the assumption that dis- on of languages, rather than allowing media through which social and politi- ingual' as a category ultimately serves y this has helped bolster the status of es (Heller 2007: 4–5; Woolard 1999; unded identity). Examining the proc- orary nation-states concerned with ividual actors who enact bilingual- cal concerns are reflected and reified kers). This perspective, informed by n of the bilingual that is shaped in a actionist factors.

contexts state-run institutions such ces of bilingualism because of their for literature on indigenous Mexico). es designed to grapple with language the dominance of Castilian Spanish.

This is accomplished through erasure of other languages by denying their speakers social capital and resources; in a sense, they are incomplete citizens. 'Rather than considering them an asset, [other] languages (Arabic, etc.) are considered an obstacle to integration. This is demonstrated by the fact that educational actions and resources are directed preferentially to ensuring the teaching of the monolingual norm' (Moyer and Rojo 2007: 145). In addition to implicit policies, ideological structures that moralise about the language's usefulness, classifying some languages and consequently their speakers as outmoded or not fully able to participate in civic activity, deny speakers total citizenship (143). In the case of Spain, full citizenship is achieved by fulfilling normative expectations, so that 'students who own a valued resource (namely, knowledge of the language of classroom instruction) because of their social and regional origin, are considered normal participants who are legitimate in the social space of the school' (148). Being a partial citizen not only has ideological implications but also material ones, where access to healthcare, government and the economy affect more than the ego. Linguistic competencies in themselves provide access to resources. As Bourdieu writes, language is tied intimately to power:

The linguistic relation of power is never defined solely on the relation between the linguistic competences present. And the weight of different agents depends on their symbolic capital, i.e. on the recognition, institutionalized or not, that they receive from a group. (Bourdieu 1984: 72)

The material consequences of bilingualism in the global economy may have subtle manifestations, as in the case described by Heller (2005). It is within the shifting state of the new globalised economic conditions that workers in Montreal are 'stuck in the transition' as the world becomes increasingly interconnected through processes of globalisation. In examining the case of Canadian language workers (translators, mediators), Heller articulates the role of language produced as a commodity, pointing out that within the framework of the globalised economy 'we used to sell our physical labour; now we sell our intellectual and communicative labour, both as a skill and as a cultural artefact' (Heller 2005: 5). According to da Silva et al.:

contrary to what one might expect given Canada's 'linguistic duality', inherited from its 'founding people' (the English and French), it is multilingualism and not just bilingualism that is valued and commodified. This value, however, is not institutionalized because Canada remains 'officially' bilingual and 'unofficially' multilingual – a linguistic reality the state refuses to recognize for fear of discrediting its nationalist roots. (da Silva et al. 2007: 188)

### 3. Social contexts of language choice and codeswitching

There have been two basic approaches to understanding the social contexts of language choice and codeswitching (the alternation/insertion of two or more varieties within the speech/sign stream). Auer and Di Luzio (1992) and Li Wei (1998) characterise them as the 'brought-along meaning' and the 'brought-about meaning' approaches. We will use these distinctions to organise some classical and more contemporary approaches to the problem.

### 3.1 'Brought-along meaning' and the variability of identity

'Brought-along meaning' approaches view identity construction as primarily indexical: Language X indexes an identity as an X-er, whereas the identity of a Y-er is achieved by speaking Y-ish (adapted from Fishman 1965). In these cases, social meaning is 'brought along' with the language being spoken in the interaction. Ferguson's classical conception of diglossia (1991) defines two complementary languages: the 'high' language, H, of education, literature, writing and formal oral communication, and the 'low' language, L, used for informal oral purposes. This framework assumes direct and indirect indexicality (Ochs 1993) for a given language choice. To illustrate what is meant by H and L languages with a concrete example: in Morocco, a complex history of language contact between Berber, Hebrew, Spanish, French and Arabic speakers (Chetrit 1994, 2000), alongside a history of Judaism, Islam and Spanish and French colonialism, has led to a situation where there are several dominant and subordinated languages, all with complex indexicalities. Widespread codeswitching occurs despite ideologies of language purity accompanying the spread of Islam in Africa and the Middle East (McIntosh 2002; Haeri 2003). Simply considering Arabic in Morocco, one can speak of (i) urban Moroccan Arabic varieties, (ii) rural Moroccan Arabic varieties, (iii) Hassaniya Arabic, a regional variety spoken in the south, (iv) Judaeo-Arabic of the remaining Moroccan Jewish population, (v) the standardised Modern Standard Arabic (*Fuṣḥā*) that is widely understood in the Middle East and taught in schools along with French (Boum 2008), and (vi) Classical, Qur'anic Arabic. According to Ennaji, the direction of codeswitching is determined by social class:

Upper class people code switch *from* French *to* urban Arabic, but rarely to Berber or rural Arabic because these are outside their geographic and social domains. Likewise, middle class people tend to switch *from* urban Arabic *to* French, rural Arabic, or Berber. As for the working class, they tend to codeswitch more frequently as they get into contact with the middle class, the upper class and the business area. (Ennaji 2005: 145)

Because of their prestige and involvement in the school system, French, urban Arabic and *Fuṣḥā* are H languages, while Berber, rural Arabic, Judaeo-Arabic, and Hassaniya are L languages. It's important to remember here that one person or situation's L might be another's H. But the indexicality doesn't stop there. Classical and Standard Arabic, with their associations with literacy, politics and religion, are symbolic of masculinity (Sadiqi 2003; Ennaji 2005; see also Haeri 1991 for similarities with Cairene Arabic). In contrast, Berber becomes indexically associated with female domains (Hoffman 2008), partly because there is almost no historical association between Berber and literacy (Berber-medium education has until recently been suppressed), which has highlighted Berber's L status as a minoritised, home-domain, rural language spoken by 'large populations of rural and illiterate women . . . However, this does not entail that Berber men do not speak their mother tongue; it only entails that they speak it less frequently than women' (Ennaji 2005: 146). In this situation, men have greater social and geographical mobility than women, and Berber has acquired gendered associations alongside these gendered usage patterns. The particular social history of this region has produced the alignment of an ethnicised, classed, spatialised gendered identity (Berber, rural, female) with a specific linguistic variety.

Another example of an analysis Oberwart, Austria (Gal 1978, 1979) was phrased as the answer to the question 'get wives?' The answer is because in Hungarian was the L language, and German, on the other hand, was the H language, associated with modernity and progress. German usage was seen as producing the possibility of a life of modernity. In the Moroccan case, it is the women in Africa who are responsible for the variability in the alignment of identity. The most important aspects of current research link between a particular language and gender. Gendered identities may align with socio-historical factors, rendering some more conservative (or linguistically more conservative) in the forefront of language standardisation. In Cheshire and Gardner-Chloros 1999, historical conditions tie fluid and localised figurations of language use (Mendoza-Denton 2008) to categories such as women signers in Burkina Faso (Bangali 2008) create divisions that are deep and long-lasting.

Blom and Gumperz's (1972) idea of 'indexicality' is central to the situation and 'assumes a situation [involving] clear changes in social conditions and obligations' (Blom and Gumperz 1972: 13). A situational language shift to using a particular language as a bureaucrat was a widely held communication strategy is not related to a change in situation, but to a change in social context concerned. It would be switching into a language that indexes the social meanings that are relevant to the situation.

Consider the following example of an interview conducted in 1994 by Norma with two girls ('Cristy' and 'Pilar') from the same school. The interview is on language, youth and gangs (see Ennaji 2005 for more research). Norma, Cristy and Pilar are all codeswitchers. Cristy and Pilar are from the same school and the same Catholic church. The three participants remain the same throughout the interview – but when Cristy talks, she uses reported speech in Spanish. This illustrates how to establish forms of footing and alignment of persons, real or imagined, whose variability is not a neutral phenomenon, but is linked to the speaker and the hearer(s) orienting themselves to the situation.

## of identity

tity construction as primarily indexical: reas the identity of a Y-er is achieved by n these cases, social meaning is 'brought nteraction. Ferguson's classical concep- ary languages: the 'high' language, H, of nunication, and the 'low' language, L, : assumes direct and indirect indexicality trate what is meant by H and L languages ex history of language contact between eakers (Chetrit 1994, 2000), alongside a h colonialism, has led to a situation where guages, all with complex indexicalities. ogies of language purity accompanying st (McIntosh 2002; Haeri 2003). Simply (i) urban Moroccan Arabic varieties, (ii) Arabic, a regional variety spoken in the cean Jewish population, (v) the standard- dely understood in the Middle East and 08), and (vi) Classical, Qur'ānic Arabic. ing is determined by social class:

French to urban Arabic, but rarely to are outside their geographic and social le tend to switch *from* urban Arabic to r the working class, they tend to codes- contact with the middle class, the upper (5: 145)

ne school system, French, urban Arabic arabic, Judaeo-Arabic, and Hassaniya are hat one person or situation's L might be ere. Classical and Standard Arabic, with ion, are symbolic of masculinity (Sadiqi arities with Cairene Arabic). In contrast, male domains (Hoffman 2008), partly n between Berber and literacy (Berber- ressed), which has highlighted Berber's language spoken by 'large populations : does not entail that Berber men do not ey speak it less frequently than women' greater social and geographical mobility d associations alongside these gendered his region has produced the alignment of ity (Berber, rural, female) with a specific

Another example of an analysis using an indexical approach is Gal's classic study in Oberwart, Austria (Gal 1978, 1979). The shift from Hungarian to German in Austria was phrased as the answer to the question 'why can't Hungarian-speaking peasant men get wives?' The answer is because in the communities where the ethnography was done, Hungarian was the L language, linked to family, tradition, the elders and farming. German, on the other hand, was the H language, envisioned as the one indexing youth, modernity and progress. German use was understood by prospective marriage partners as producing the possibility of a life away from the hardships of farming, but unlike the Moroccan case, it is the women in Austria who were aligned with the H over the L. This variability in the alignment of identities with linguistic choices highlights one of the most important aspects of current understandings of bilingual situations: the indexical link between a particular language and a particular identity cannot be taken for granted. Gendered identities may align with dominant or subordinated varieties, depending on socio-historical factors, rendering suspicious such universalising statements as 'women are conservative (or linguistically insecure, or prestige-seeking), and will always be on the forefront of language standardization' (see discussions in Labov 1991; Eckert 1990; Cheshire and Gardner-Chloros 1998; Mendoza-Denton 2004). Unique and particular historical conditions tie fluid and locally relevant identity categories to particular configurations of language use (Mendoza-Denton 2002; Bucholtz and Hall 2004a). Social categories such as women signers in Ireland (LeMaster 2006), Tuntun-speaking blacksmiths in Burkina Faso (Bangali 2002), and estate-class workers in Guyana (Rickford 1986) create divisions that are deeply felt at the level of language ideology and linguistic usage.

Blom and Gumperz's (1972) idea of *situational shifting* involves code selection according to the situation and 'assumes a direct relationship between language and the social situation [involving] clear changes in the participants' definition of each others' rights and obligations' (Blom and Gumperz 1972: 424). In Oberwart, as documented by Gal, a situational language shift to using German in the doctor's office or with a government bureaucrat was a widely held community norm. *Metaphorical shifting*, on the other hand, is not related to a change in situation *per se*, but would be indexically linked to the varieties concerned. It would be switching into German *as though one were speaking to a doctor*, and indexing the social meanings that are available in those situations.

Consider the following example of metaphorical switching. This excerpt comes from an interview conducted in 1994 by Norma Mendoza-Denton with two teenage Latina girls ('Cristy' and 'Pilar') from the San Francisco Bay Area while conducting research on language, youth and gangs (see Mendoza-Denton 2008 for background on this research). Norma, Cristy and Pilar are all bilingual Spanish-English speakers and routine codeswitchers. Cristy and Pilar are 13 and 15 years old respectively, and they attend the same school and the same Catholic church. The interview situation doesn't change – the three participants remain the same throughout the interaction, with no other interlocutors present – but when Cristy talks about her mother, voicing her speech and opinions, she uses reported speech in Spanish. Voicing involves 'encounters in which individuals establish forms of footing and alignment with voices indexed by speech with social types of persons, real or imagined, whose voices they take them to be' (Agha 2005: 38). Voicing is not a neutral phenomenon, but is loaded with value and indexical significance as both the speaker and the hearer(s) orient themselves in positions relative to the voice.

## Example 1: Topic/metaphorical switching:

- 1 Cristy: My parents said that if I got married to a guy and he treated me bad,  
 2 **me pegaba o algo,**  
*if he hit me or something,*  
 3 that I couldn't go back home . . .
- 4 Pilar: You know, I mean,  
 5 if you make a mistake, what –  
 6 you're going to have to pay for your mistake?  
 7 I don't believe that, you know,  
 8 if you got married,  
 9 and your husband is beating you,  
 10 I'm sorry, but leave him!  
 11 I mean, **nomás por no estar pecando** or whatever, how can you . . .  
*just so you won't be in sin*
- 12 Cristy: **O nomás porque,** you know,  
*Or just because, you know,*  
**porque tus padres te enseñaron a seguir eso . . .**  
*your parents taught you to follow that . . .*
- 13 doesn't mean **que te tienes que estar ahí.**  
*that you have to stay.*

In this example, Cristy switches into Spanish when voicing her Spanish-speaking parents' admonitions to remain in an abusive relationship for the sake of preserving the marriage. Pilar positions herself relative to that voicing by invoking, through an intonationally exaggerated codeswitch (underlined) a popular phrasing of religious ideology, '**por no estar pecando/so you won't be in sin**', an ideology emanating from older members of the community and the church. Together, in mutual, sequential positioning, Pilar and Cristy use Spanish not only to invoke, but to effectively distance themselves from their elders and the Catholic church. It is important to note that not only persons experiencing or encountering the voice align with it in certain ways, but the individual invoking the voice also (dis)aligns with it. Hill points out that 'the voice system interacts with prosodic structure; prosodic strategies, particularly intonation, are important to development and a prosodic interruption, the break through the narrative voice of an "intonational shadow"' (Hill 1995: 109). It is this 'intonational shadow' that functions in a micro-context for understanding the discursive implications of voicing and its eventual enregisterment as stereotypically indexing social 'types' of persons. In Cristy and Pilar's case, the 'intonational shadow' itself indexes a social type – the older, traditional, church-going woman who would not leave her husband despite abuse. According to Silverstein (2003: 202),

interactional happenings are social-actional 'events' of interpretable cultural meanings only to the degree they 'instantiate' – indexically invoke – macro-sociological partitions of social place, in terms of which cultural values can thus be said to be indexically 'articulated'. This connection of identity with value manifests itself in the micro-contextual order to be sure, where perspectival

interests are played out; but it is  
 (Silverstein 2003: 202)

A further point to be made about P starts in English, with temporary switch Scotton's rational-actor Markedness English is the unmarked, ongoing, *mat*. That is to say, the conversation proceeds a rational actor – switches to Spanish in associated with Spanish. There can on to it signals a change in the dynamics model, Myers-Scotton allowed that cod frame, invoking two rights-and-obligat mutually exclusive possibilities, the bir Such an approach offers a marked cor that of Woolard (1999), which explores understand Pilar and Cristy's Spanish : one may also theorise them as hybridity of two or more different linguistic cons

## 3.2 Brought-about meaning, performat

Auer's second category of approaches i 'brought-about meaning' (Auer and D toward Conversation Analysis, social me about) accomplishment rather than a c community linkages (Auer 1984). This back as Valdes (1981), where it was the found to be symbolically significant, ar requests. In other words, the switch its virtue of having built up a contrast wit in the sequential context. And yet one by *not* switching. Francom (2009) docu in a Mexican *panadería* (bread shop) in ' and the fact that both the bread shop w service interaction unfolded with the w only in English. They understood each the course of ten turns at talk. The lack worker took a turn in English in the mi the customer. When interviewed later, tl Latinos in the shop could produce the e If the *expectation* is of Spanish usage by . and accommodation are themselves inter

Viewing the interpretation of social i ment is a significant departure from a cor approach. In the first place, it requires



g:  
 married to a guy and he treated me bad,

r your mistake?

ou,

**pecando** or whatever, how can you . . .

aron a seguir eso . . .

w that . . .

ue estar ahí.

when voicing her Spanish-speaking relationship for the sake of preserving that voicing by invoking, through an (l) a popular phrasing of religious ideology, an ideology emanating from older, in mutual, sequential positioning, but to effectively distance themselves important to note that not only persons it in certain ways, but the individual ts out that 'the voice system interacts ticularly intonation, are important to eak through the narrative voice of an 'intonational shadow' that functions in mplications of voicing and its eventual types' of persons. In Cristy and Pilar's al type – the older, traditional, church- spite abuse. According to Silverstein

onal 'events' of interpretable cultural ntiante' – indexically invoke – macro- rms of which cultural values can thus his connection of identity with value order to be sure, where perspectival

interests are played out; but it really constitutes a universe of cultural imagination. (Silverstein 2003: 202)

A further point to be made about Pilar and Cristy's example is that the conversation starts in English, with temporary switches and insertions in Spanish. In terms of Myers-Scotton's rational-actor Markedness Model (Myers-Scotton 1983, 1988, 1993a, b), English is the unmarked, ongoing, *matrix language* and Spanish is the *embedded language*. That is to say, the conversation proceeds ordinarily in English until one of the speakers – a rational actor – switches to Spanish in order to highlight the 'rights and obligations set' associated with Spanish. There can only be one matrix language at a time, and a change to it signals a change in the dynamics of the conversation. In later formulations of the model, Myers-Scotton allowed that codeswitching itself might be the neutral (unmarked) frame, invoking two rights-and-obligations (RO) sets, but the core of her model assumes mutually exclusive possibilities, the binary choice between which gives rise to meaning. Such an approach offers a marked contrast to dialogic, Bakhtinian approaches such as that of Woolard (1999), which explores simultaneity rather than binarism. Just as we may understand Pilar and Cristy's Spanish and English alternations as rational-actor choices, one may also theorise them as hybridity, 'the mixing, within a single concrete utterance, of two or more different linguistic consciousnesses' (Bakhtin 1981: 429).

### 3.2 Brought-about meaning, performativity and the crafting of identity

Auer's second category of approaches to social motivation in language choice is that of 'brought-about meaning' (Auer and Di Luzio 1992; Li Wei 1998). Inspired by a turn toward Conversation Analysis, social meaning was understood as an interactive (brought-about) accomplishment rather than a calculation of rewards or a given from the prior community linkages (Auer 1984). This type of approach was prefigured at least as far back as Valdes (1981), where it was the *fact* of a codeswitch, not its direction, that was found to be symbolically significant, and which served to both aggravate and mitigate requests. In other words, the switch itself was an interactional resource, functioning by virtue of having built up a contrast with the previous turn, and thus only interpretable in the sequential context. And yet one can also observe a contrast and tension obtained by *not* switching. Francom (2009) documents an unusual case of lack of accommodation in a Mexican *panadería* (bread shop) in Tucson, Arizona. Despite pervasive bilingualism and the fact that both the bread shop worker and customer were bilingual Latinos, the service interaction unfolded with the worker speaking only Spanish and the customer only in English. They understood each other perfectly, but simply did not switch over the course of ten turns at talk. The lack of switching produced such an effect that a co-worker took a turn in English in the middle of the interaction to address/accommodate the customer. When interviewed later, the co-worker remarked that the use of English by Latinos in the shop could produce the effect of lack of solidarity (Francom 2009: 13–14). If the *expectation* is of Spanish usage by Latinos in the bread shop, then lack of switching and accommodation are themselves interactional events.

Viewing the interpretation of social meaning strictly as an interactional accomplishment is a significant departure from a conventionally associative 'brought-along meaning' approach. In the first place, it requires that analysts dispense with their interpretive

categories of what they think the languages may index and commit themselves to locally relevant interpretations demonstrating how speakers orient to the identity categories (Auer and Di Luzio 1992; Li Wei 1998; Gafaranga 2007; see Mendoza-Denton 2002 for a similar strand of developments in ethnographic sociolinguistics). New identity categories may well be emergent in codeswitching, and not just with an additive function that codeswitching as a matrix language would have us posit: a new, brought-about meaning is not just the addition of two rights-and-obligations sets. Returning to the Moroccan situation above, we expand on an example given by Ennaji (2005): when two Moroccan doctors switch from Moroccan Standard Arabic to French in talking about medical terminology, and then produce a joking aside in rural Moroccan Arabic, they produce and perform for each other both cosmopolitan and local identities – privileged enough to switch to French when needed, and down-home enough to not speak French all the time; transnational and educated, yet local and authentic. Bentahila and Davies (2002) claim that pervasive French-Arabic switching in Morocco and Algeria produces a new indexicality among *rai* (north African popular music) performers and ties them simultaneously to global and local by the very order and nature of the switches in the songs. So strong is this local association that lyrics of the songs must be ‘uncodeswitched’ (delocalised) to be marketed in the Gulf States. And yet the brought-about approaches have structural consequences too. In a related article, Davies and Bentahila (2008) analyse the poetic and structural functions of these switches, where, as in natural conversation, switch patterns highlight semantic opposition or similarities, provide emphasis, and achieve various types of parallelism. According to Li Wei, codeswitching ‘can help the speaker restart a conversation at the end of an interactive episode, or to change conversational direction; it also helps participants to keep track of the main ‘drift’ of the interaction by mapping out complex nested structural patterns in the conversation’ (Li Wei 1998: 169).

An example of an interactional codeswitch comes from the work of Quintos-Pozos (2006) on Mexican Sign Language (MSL)/American Sign Language (ASL) bilingualism. In this excerpt, three bilingual ASL–MSL participants are talking about cooking. The reiterative switch from ASL to MSL is noted in bold type.

Participant 1: point-middle finger TOMATO (.) **TOMATE** ADD-  
INGREDIENTS MIX gesture: ‘thumbs-up’

Gloss: ‘( . . . and then you take) tomatoes (.) **tomatoes** and you add them to the other ingredients and mix everything together. It’s great.’ (Quintos-Pozos 2006: 183)

Because of the delay between the first ASL item and the MSL switch, as well as eyegaze gestures towards the two other participants, this switch in its context was interpreted as emphasis or accommodation to the other interlocutors who were both frequent users of MSL. A reiterative switch with an interactional function of emphasis does not signal a distinctive, symbolic value, as would be the case under an approach such as the markedness model. And yet we (and others, notably Gafaranga 2007) cannot emphasise enough that the two approaches are not incompatible, and indeed *must* be applied simultaneously if we are to capture the complex performative effects of voicing and stylisation in codeswitching and language choice. How else can we capture the resolute ambiguity of a

Catalan comedian whose utterances be-  
tween the two languages is identifiable as either Castilian Spanish or  
in-action brings to the forefront two  
category in itself, and choice within a

#### 4. Circulations: passing, mock l

When two or more languages are a-  
exist in the community choice space  
production and interpretation. Inde-  
of the various intonational/prosodic  
patterning and recurrence in the con-  
1993; Rampton 1995; Silverstein 200  
meaning approaches alert us to the se  
indexicalities. With any of these mi-  
larger situations of sociality, politica  
belonging, which give an utterance, a  
life of its own.

Orcutt-Gachiri (2008), in her stu-  
language policing that fixates on cor-  
whereby the pronunciation of Englis-  
ous Kenyan languages. But shrub-  
ence, since bilingual foreigners by de-  
Americans do *twenging*). As Orcutt-G

For Kenyans, ridicule of sh-  
guages and people in Kenya  
linguistically and economical-  
who benefit from making fu-  
speak indigenous languages,  
who learned English as a se-  
accent. In Kenya, only the u-  
English as a first language, s-  
(Orcutt-Gachiri 2008: 7)

The contested in-betweenness of sh-  
cursive levels. It is not only in face-to-  
are newspaper columns inviting reade-  
sending into wider circulation ideolo-  
persons’ who shrub. Linking these ic-  
mative moments is one of the aims of  
Chapter 7).

We close with the example of Os-  
(1995) ‘intonational shadows’, the pr-  
speaker’s production. While conducti-  
Angelenos, Osborne recorded Ana, w

index and commit themselves to locally  
 kers orient to the identity categories  
 2007; see Mendoza-Denton 2002 for a  
 iolinguistics). New identity categories  
 st with an additive function that codes-  
 : a new, brought-about meaning is not  
 i. Returning to the Moroccan situation  
 i (2005): when two Moroccan doctors  
 i in talking about medical terminology,  
 Arabic, they produce and perform for  
 privileged enough to switch to French  
 eak French all the time; transnational  
 nd Davies (2002) claim that pervasive  
 produces a new indexicality among *rai*  
 es them simultaneously to global and  
 s in the songs. So strong is this local  
 'switched' (delocalised) to be marketed  
 roaches have structural consequences  
 008) analyse the poetic and structural  
 onversation, switch patterns highlight  
 isis, and achieve various types of paral-  
 help the speaker restart a conversation  
 conversational direction; it also helps  
 e interaction by mapping out complex  
 Wei 1998: 169).

mes from the work of Quintos-Pozos  
 ican Sign Language (ASL) bilingual-  
 participants are talking about cooking.  
 l in bold type.

ATO (.) TOMATE ADD-  
 -up'

(.) **tomatoes** and you add them to the  
 ether. It's great.' (Quintos-Pozos 2006:

nd the MSL switch, as well as eyegaze  
 switch in its context was interpreted as  
 utors who were both frequent users of  
 function of emphasis does not signal a  
 nder an approach such as the marked-  
 iranga 2007) cannot emphasise enough  
 nd indeed *must* be applied simultane-  
 ive effects of voicing and stylisation in  
 we capture the resolute ambiguity of a

Catalan comedian whose utterances build up bilingual tension by being *bivalent*, not identifiable as either Castilian Spanish or Catalan (Woolard 1999)? A notion of bilingualism-in-action brings to the forefront two primary interrelated ideas: the idea of choice as a category in itself, and choice within a larger system of tension.

#### 4. Circulations: passing, mock languages, blends

When two or more languages are available as part of the community repertoire, they exist in the community choice space as potential resources from which to draw in both production and interpretation. Indexical approaches allow us to attempt identification of the various intonational/prosodic/lexical 'shadows' (Hill 2005), using evidence of patterning and recurrence in the community to tie them to potential social types (Butler 1993; Rampton 1995; Silverstein 2003; Bucholtz and Hall 2004a), while brought-about meaning approaches alert us to the sequential dynamics that produce hybridity and new indexicalities. With any of these microcontextual situations comes the mobilisation of larger situations of sociality, political situations, and ideologies of belonging and not belonging, which give an utterance, informed by the situated politics of bilingualism, a life of its own.

Orcutt-Gachiri (2008), in her study of Kenyan language shift, identifies a kind of language policing that fixates on correcting and ridiculing a practice called *shrubbing*, whereby the pronunciation of English words is influenced by interference from indigenous Kenyan languages. But shrubbing is not just English-Kenyan language interference, since bilingual foreigners by definition can't do shrubbing (but it is said that the Americans do *twenging*). As Orcutt-Gachiri explains:

For Kenyans, ridicule of shrubbing seeks to constitute the hierarchy of languages and people in Kenya, creating an elite class of Kenyans who participate linguistically and economically in the upper echelons of Kenyan life. The people who benefit from making fun of shrubbing, therefore, are Kenyans who do not speak indigenous languages, because they are less likely to shrub than Kenyans who learned English as a second language in school and may have a heavier accent. In Kenya, only the urban wealthy, a very small group, grow up speaking English as a first language, so this reinforces existing class distinctions, as well. (Orcutt-Gachiri 2008: 7)

The contested in-betweenness of shrubbing appears at both the discursive and metadiscursive levels. It is not only in face-to-face contexts that Kenyans police shrubbing; there are newspaper columns inviting readers to send in shrubs that they have witnessed, thus sending into wider circulation ideologies based on essentialist stereotypes of 'types of persons' who shrub. Linking these iconic types to the linguistic detail of specific performative moments is one of the aims of our project (see especially Mendoza-Denton 2008, Chapter 7).

We close with the example of Osborne (2008), who instrumentally analysed Hill's (1995) 'intonational shadows', the prosodic traces of other voices present in a single speaker's production. While conducting fieldwork with middle-aged Mexican-American Angelenos, Osborne recorded Ana, who had moved from East Los Angeles to a more

affluent suburb when she was about 12 years old. Caught in the tension between Anglo-assimilation and Mexican-national rhetoric, Ana carved a linguistic niche in performance through the modulation of voices in monolingual English speech. Ana's contested positionality is indexed through her performances, in which she strategically 'voices' the social personae in metrical contrast to the ambient discourse to calibrate and signal her stance and identity in relation to them. Osborne's study shows that a series of measurable paralinguistic features such as pitch and utterance duration differ from normal speech in the performance of 'Mexicano' and 'White' voices. On average, 'Mexicano' performances exhibited slightly longer duration times than the 'normal' voice, and 'White' performances exhibited greater pitch variation. These performances carry with them pragmatic force, are socially salient, and are the realisation of identity work, formulating a register as understood by Agha (2007). Registers carry with them a pragmatic force of signs (in this case a specific performance) derived from the socio-historical contexts in which they are embedded. The implications of the social and personal impacts of strategic performances of Mexicano and White voices in natural conversation underscore the performative quality of a bilingual person's experience.

In socially salient realisations of identity work in multilingual interactions, speakers use pitch, duration, gestures, bivalency, ambiguity and presence and absence of switching. Bi- and multilinguals take advantage of the contrasts created by switches in code, or by the mere expectation of switches. The next task of research is to trace more thoroughly the connections between political economies, their indexical relationships with social types and personae, and the specific linguistic deployments of these personae in voicings.

## Communities of

### 1. Introduction

Despite being acknowledged as a (Labov 2005; Meyerhoff 2005), the Community of Phonology (CofP) has received an incomplete treatment of peripheralities (Labov and McConnell-Ginet's (1992) paper) as a way to access the locally constructed linguistic spaces. Labov and McConnell-Ginet effectively called for research in peripheralities, which have previously been classified as 'non-central' concerns of the CofP approach.

In the light of this observation, this study in sociolinguistics, focusing specifically on a case study it will be argued that, despite the fact that it does more than simply *handle* peripheralities, the CofP provides insights into the understanding of language change.

### 2. The place of the CofP in sociolinguistics

How any model handles a concept is determined by the way it is used. Much of the work in sociolinguistics – 'linguistics proper' – is concerned with the study of sound change. Research of this kind is concerned with the study of language usage, the goal being to document the linguistic constraints. As Eckert (2003) argues, researchers generalise about populations because, in order to track patterns of language use across time and space, they must generalise.

However, as Labov (2001: 325) argues, the progress of language change – when we wish to track changes (Labov's concern), or wish to